

November 30, 2018

Re: Valor Development, LLC | Ladybird Project | Responses to questions/comments by Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3E and attending community at meeting held on November 8, 2018

To: Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3E

From: Will Lansing, Valor Development, LLC

Cc: Advisory Neighborhood Commission 3D
Shelley Repp, Citizens for Responsible Development
William Clarkson, Spring Valley Neighborhood Association
Jeff Kraskin, Spring Valley Opponents
John Wheeler, Ward 3 Vision
Josh Posnick, Mill Creek Residential

Dear Commissioners,

Please find below responses to the questions and comments on the Ladybird project that were made by the ANC and community at the meeting held on November 8, 2018. The questions and comments addressed below were compiled from meeting notes taken by our collective team. Please note, in the interest of transparency we are providing a copy of this memorandum to each of the parties involved in the Ladybird project design review case that is pending before the Zoning Commission (Z.C. Case No. 16-23).

We believe this is a comprehensive list of the comments/questions raised at the November 8, 2018, meeting. Upon review, please let us know if you have any questions or need additional information. We look forward to attending your next meeting on December 13, 2018. Thank you for your continued interest in the Ladybird project.

1. Status of DDOT's plan to install a Capital Bikeshare station near the project site

Response: During a discussion on November 13, 2018, DDOT stated that it plans to install a new Capital Bikeshare station near the intersection of Massachusetts and 48th Street NW in 2019 pending equipment supply, location availability, and an upcoming review of the Bikeshare Development plan. This is NOT one of the 31 stations that were identified in Capital Bikeshare's most recent expansion plans. However, DDOT indicated that if the ANC were to pass a resolution stating that they want a station located proximate to the Ladybird project site, DDOT would take the ANC's request into consideration when prioritizing what stations are installed. If the ANC has a preferred location for the future Capital Bikeshare station it should identify the location as part of its resolution. Per the MOU between Valor and the ANC, Valor will continue to work with the ANC and DDOT on efforts to install a Capital Bikeshare station in the vicinity of the project site. In addition, included in Valor's Transportation Demand Management plan for the project is a commitment to offer either a one-year membership to Capital Bikeshare or a one-year membership to a car-sharing service to each residential unit for the initial lease of each unit. Should an initial lessee choose the

one-year Capital Bikeshare membership, this would include use of any electric bikes for so long as they are part of the Capital Bikeshare fleet. In addition, in coordination with DDOT, Valor has further committed that if an agreement has not been reached with a car sharing service to occupy the four dedicated car sharing spaces in the garage then Valor will provide an additional year of Capital Bikeshare memberships to new residents.

2. Confirmation on the amount of affordable housing provided in the project

Response: The Ladybird project will fully comply with Inclusionary Zoning (“IZ”) requirements. Based on the current plans, the project will contain approximately 27,440 gross square feet of affordable housing, which is approximately 1,231 gross square feet less than the amount contained in the December 2017 plans. This reduction is primarily due to the approximately 42,000 square foot reduction in gross floor area (“GFA”) that was made following the public hearing in January 2018 to further address concerns over the height and mass of the project. However, despite the reduction in overall affordable square footage, the percentage of overall residential floor area devoted to affordable dwelling units and the number of affordable dwelling units has increased, and the number of affordable three bedroom units has remained the same.

3. Addition of a “snapping point” to address rideshare pick-up and drop-off

Response: DDOT has only requested geo-fencing for very specific locations throughout the District, for example at the Wharf and Audi Field. DDOT isn’t requesting that the Applicant work with Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) to implement geo-fencing at the Ladybird site. As a way to help control where TNC’s pick up and drop off at the Ladybird site, DDOT has advised that appropriate addresses for the grocery and residential components of the project be selected (i.e. choose single, specific addresses rather than have multiple addresses) so that when users of TNCs request a car, they go to the correct place.

4. Loss of porosity and open space due to the elimination of Windom Walk

Response: Site porosity and open space is addressed in more than one way. With respect to open space, the current overall lot occupancy of the project is similar to that shown in the December 2017 plans. This is primarily due to the fact that the previously proposed Building 2 had a much larger footprint than the townhomes that are currently proposed. Regarding porosity, consistent with the Zoning Regulation design review standards, the project will still improve the overall physical porosity of the site by providing substantial aesthetic and pedestrian improvements along the north-south public alley leading from Yuma Street to Massachusetts Avenue, as well as along the east-west private/public alley between 48th Street and the Spring Valley Shopping Center. While the previously proposed Windom Walk would have provided additional site porosity, as noted at the public hearings in January 2018, there were legitimate pedestrian safety concerns with how Windom Walk connected to the alley system near the loading facilities for the Ladybird project and the AU Building. Despite the elimination of Windom Walk, the proposed Windom Park still provides visual porosity/relief to the site and the views along 48th Street and Windom Place. The location and dimensions of Windom Park, which still provides over 40% of the open space that would have been provided by Windom Walk, have been designed to relate to the pattern of substantial

courtyards along 48th Street and to “receive” the view along Windom Place. This is a far better treatment of this portion of the site due to the legitimate pedestrian safety conditions that would have resulted from Windom Walk. Indeed, rather than facilitate pedestrian circulation through the site to an area that is devoted to parking and loading access, it is a much better solution to direct primary pedestrian circulation to the sidewalks along 48th and Yuma Streets, which lead to signalized crosswalks along Massachusetts Avenue, and where approximately 80 linear feet of curb cuts will be removed and additional pedestrian improvements will be constructed at select intersections.

5. Provision of exemplary public space

Response: Under the Zoning Regulations design review standards, public gathering spaces and open spaces are encouraged, especially where neighborhood open space is lacking; near transit stations or hubs; and when they can enhance existing parks and the waterfront. None of these circumstances exist at the project site. Nonetheless, the project will provide two notable open spaces that will be available to the public, Windom Park and the northwest plaza adjacent to the grocery store. In addition, the project will devote open space along the surrounding alleys for circulation improvements. Overall, the current plans still provide approximately 8,600 square feet of open space.

The design review standards also encourage sites to be developed in a manner that promotes connectivity both internally and with surrounding neighborhoods including, among other things, providing pedestrian pathways through developments, incorporating transit and bicycle facilities and amenities, and integrating large sites through streets and pedestrian connections. As discussed above, the project will improve pedestrian circulation not only around the site through significant upgrades to adjacent public space, including the elimination of approximately 80 linear feet of curb cuts, but also along the alley system surrounding the site at locations that are safe and intuitive. In addition, the project will exceed the minimum required number of short- and long-term bicycle parking space and provide shower and changing facilities for service/retail employees.

6. Re-evaluate opening the median along Massachusetts Avenue near the intersection with the north-south alley

Response: Per discussions with DDOT, there is concern that a break in the median and resulting left-turn movements from the north-south alley to southbound Massachusetts Avenue would conflict with the HAWK signal that is being contemplated near this same location, and potentially with the openings in the median that separates Massachusetts Avenue from the Spring Valley Village shopping center service road.

7. Evaluate an interactive fountain in Windom Park

Response: We are unable to accommodate this request at this point in the project. Further, given the intimate size and location of Windom Park an interactive fountain in this location may not be the ideal treatment for this space, which is envisioned to be more passive.

8. Evaluate potential to convert two sunken courtyards along 48th Street to “parklets” similar to Windom Park

Response: Elimination of these courtyards would result in a substantial loss of dwelling units, and consequently reduce the amount of affordable housing that is provided. The significant reductions that have been made to the program and massing of the project since September 2016, and the complexities of the development structure needed to successfully redevelop the project site, have required Valor to find creative ways to achieve the residential program, including the provision of high-quality cellar units that will front on the proposed courtyards. These cellar units contribute to the overall amount of affordable housing required under the Zoning Regulations. The elimination of these units would require the Applicant to evaluate ways to recapture some of these units above grade, in part by reducing the substantial above-grade setbacks that have been provided to reduce the scale and massing of the project. As currently proposed, the courtyards along 48th Street serve the dual purpose of providing light, air, and open space to these important cellar-level units, while also reducing the scale of the project and providing aesthetic value along adjacent public space.

9. Evaluate potential of implementing a private shuttle for residents to and from a Metrorail station.

Response: Implementing a shuttle at this site would syphon funds away from other benefits that positively affect the greater community rather than just the residents of the development, such as the proposed HAWK signal. In addition, committing to operating the shuttle indefinitely fails to acknowledge that the manner in which people travel is rapidly changing. For example, the rapid rise of TNCs and bicycling as a regular mode of travel was not expected 5-10 years ago. While travel preferences and modes of travel will continue to change and evolve over time, walking will undoubtedly remain a consistent form of travel. As such, redirecting the funding needed to construct the HAWK signal and other pedestrian improvements at nearby intersections, which will benefit the larger community, towards a private shuttle that serves only the residents of the project is not recommended.

10. Clarification on LEED scorecard “Access to Transit” point assignment

Response: The October 2018 preliminary LEED scorecard for the project was prepared in accordance with U.S. Green Building Council Building Design + Construction standard “LEED v4 Multifamily Midrise.” As shown on the attached excerpt from the USGBC’s guidance, a project can receive one (1) LEED point under the “Access to Transit” category provided it is located within ¼ mile walking distance to a bus stop(s), and the transit service at those stops in aggregate provide a minimum of 72 daily weekday trips and 40 daily weekend trips. The N4 and N6 bus routes provide service within a quarter mile walking distance to the Ladybird project site. According to the current WMATA timetable, the N4 and N6 bus routes provide an aggregate of 88 daily weekday trips and an average of 55 daily weekend trips. As such, the project qualifies for one (1) LEED point under the “Access to Transit” category.

Regarding the timing of when the additional LEED point for transit access was reflected on the project’s preliminary LEED scorecard, the first scorecard for the project was received

from the LEED consultant in April 2016, prior to the June 2017 service changes made by WMATA to the N6 bus route. Due to the various changes that have been made to the project since the initial submission to the Zoning Commission, the scorecard was not updated until after the public hearings in January 2018. Instead, as changes were being made the project architect continued to consult with the LEED consultant to ensure that the project could still achieve LEED Gold. The preliminary LEED scorecard included in the plans submitted to the Zoning Commission in October 2018, reflects the current project plans as well as the current WMATA bus service.

11. Clarification on location of AU Building loading docks

Response: The AU Building has two loading docks that are located within the building, and there are existing signs outside the loading docks that state “Emergency Vehicle Parking Only.” In response to comments made at the ANC meeting on November 8, 2018, the Applicant is in the process of coordinating with AU regarding its loading operations to ensure that the alley behind the AU Building remains clear and accessible so that trucks and vehicles are able to access the Ladybird loading facilities and parking access at all times.

12. Clarification that the CTR takes into account the potential trips generated by Millie’s and the retail and service uses in the new Spring Valley Village building across Massachusetts Avenue. Also, does the CTR take into account the current use of the former AU Law School building?

Response: As stated in the December 27, 2017, supplemental transportation memorandum submitted to DDOT, Millie’s was not open during the time of data collection and was not included as a background development in the vehicular analysis; however, the background growth rate assumed in the CTR analysis is an accepted industry standard to account for inherent fluctuations in vacancies. The capacity analysis did include the Spring Valley Village shopping center expansion project as a background development, which added approximately 15,000 square feet of retail to the analysis. American University was in session at the time traffic counts were taken. The capacity analysis used conservative assumptions to account for any such changes in the transportation network.

13. Confirmation that the widths of the public and private alley can accommodate the size of trucks that are anticipated for the Ladybird project

Response: The width of the existing public and private alleys surrounding the project site can accommodate the trucks that are anticipated to service the Ladybird project. The updated AutoTURN analysis that was included with the supplemental transportation memorandum submitted to DDOT, which was provided to ANC 3E on November 29, 2018, clearly shows that the alleys can accommodate the trucks that are expected to service the Ladybird project.

14. Installation of parking meters along 48th and Yuma Streets

Response: A number of improvements to curbside management were proposed in the November 22, 2017, CTR, which are all subject to DDOT review and approval during the public space permitting process. These improvements included the addition of parking meters along 48th and Yuma Streets. Valor and Gorove/Slade will continue coordinating with the

community and the ANC regarding the curbside management plan, and make revisions to this plan, as needed, before it is submitted to DDOT for public space approvals.

15. Modification of curb cut along 49th Street, NW

Response: The modification of the curb cut along 49th Street, NW, including the installation of a “pork chop,” is not a transportation measure that is required to mitigate the impacts of the Ladybird project. Rather, the existing issues related to this curb cut were raised during the course of Valor’s discussions with the ANC and community on the Ladybird project. While the issues at this curb cut are not related to the Ladybird project, as part of its ongoing discussions regarding transportation around the project site Valor and Gorove/Slade will continue coordinating with DDOT and the owner of the Spring Valley Exxon Station regarding modifications to the curb cut on 49th Street, NW.

16. Status of updated Parking Management Plan (“PMP”), including updated parking allocation

Response: An updated PMP was included with the supplemental transportation memorandum submitted to DDOT, which was provided to ANC 3E on November 29, 2018.

17. Provision of pick-up/drop-off zones along 48th or Yuma to accommodate pick-up and drop-off

Response: The previously submitted curbside management plan identified pick-up/drop-off zones in front of the residential lobbies. Valor and Gorove/Slade will continue coordinating with the community and ANC regarding the curbside management plan, and make revisions to this plan, as needed, before it is submitted to DDOT for public space approvals.

18. Demonstrate that the project will provide enough parking for residents

Response: The project is providing more than the minimum amount of parking that is required under the Zoning Regulations. As proposed, the minimum parking requirement for the Ladybird project is 72 residential parking spaces and 20 retail parking spaces. In addition, pursuant to an existing Declaration of Easement and Agreement (the “Declaration”) that remains recorded against Record Lot 9 (A&T Lots 806 and 807), the Applicant must construct a minimum of 236 parking spaces for nonexclusive use by American University, the current owner of Lot 806. As such, per the Zoning Regulations and the Declaration, the Applicant must provide a minimum of 328 parking spaces. As proposed, the project will contain approximately 370 parking spaces (72 devoted to residential, 62 devoted to retail, and 236 shared with American University). Valor is in the process of establishing a lease agreement with AU whereby a portion of the 236 parking spaces will be available for exclusive access to the Ladybird project. While not finalized, the term of the lease agreement with AU is expected to be a minimum of 20 years, with options to extend beyond the initial term.

19. Relocate proposed apartment building next to the AU Building and put townhouses along Yuma Street

Response: We have crafted the massing of the building to best respond to the grade of the project site. Placing the shorter townhomes on 48th Street, where the grade is higher, allows the proposed apartment building to be shorter. Relocating the apartment building next to the AU Building and the townhomes along Yuma Street would increase the height of the apartment building and push more of the building mass onto 48th Street (eliminate the courtyards) in order to maintain the number of dwelling units. Additionally, shifting the grocery store adjacent to the AU Building is not possible given the irregular shape of the site in this location as well as the impact to the existing heritage tree.

20. Provide the square footages for the residential and retail areas in the new and previous designs (separately for above and below grade space).

Response: See attached.